Why life expectancy trends have changed, health inequalities are increasing, and our duty to respond: a view from Scotland

Gerry McCartney Consultant in Public Health NHS Health Scotland December 2019

My objectives for the next 25 minutes:

- 1. To demonstrate that life expectancy trends changed from 2012, but not everywhere
- 2. ...that this is due to changes for almost all age groups and causes of death
- 3. ...that this is leading to a rapid rise in unjust and avoidable health inequalities
- 4. ...that the causes are most likely to be economic, working through a variety of pathways
- 5. To convince you that you all have a vital role in reversing these trends

Why does this matter?

1. Life expectancy is a very good marker of overall societal progress



Why does this matter?

- 1. Life expectancy is a very good marker of overall societal progress
- 2. Underneath these numbers are personal and community tragedies
- 3. We can change these trends

Life expectancy trends changed from 2012



Ending in three-year rolling period



Ending in three-year rolling period

Projected versus actual life expectancy trends



Projection based on year-to-year variance between 1990 and 2011



Mean annual change in female life expectancy, 2012-6





Country

Mean annual change in male life expectancy, 2012-6

Mean annual change in female life expectancy



Almost all age groups and causes of death













A rapid rise in unjust and avoidable inequalities



Inequalities in premature (<75y) mortality, Scotland



The causes are economic, working through a variety of pathways

Theory for the economic causes of the life expectancy trends



Theory for the economic causes of the life expectancy trends



Percentage impact of reforms to taxes and transfer payments by household net income decile, 2010-2011 to 2021-22 tax year, Great Britain



Source: Portes et al. The cumulative impact of tax and welfare reforms. Manchester, Equality and Human Rights Commission, 2018.

Theory for the economic causes of the life expectancy trends



'It has just gone overboard now. I was actually at the doctors today about it. But again, that's money worries. My anxiety is making me really, really ill.

My anxiety has gone through the roof. I can sleep, but the minute I wake up, all I'm thinking about is money, money, money.

What have I to pay tomorrow? How am I going to get the electricity to do another two days?

It's quite scary'.

Data from the CPAG Early Warning System ['Mary'], with thanks to Morag Treanor, Heriot Watt University, CPAG and the study participants 'I've got two really good friends that I used to see them all the time. I've just not got the heart to... I just...there's nothing to tell them.

I've not been nowhere, I've not done nothing. And it comes down to, as well, I think no money, I've, ken, they talk about their work and stuff, and their families, where they've been and where they're going on holiday, and I just, I kinda... like for my birthday, it was my 40th in April, and one of my friends had organised all the girls to come over and I just felt like the chicken with one wing.

Because... I was the only one sitting there with no job, no money, and I didn't ken what I was going to eat that night. It was quite a sad situation to be in.'

Data from the CPAG Early Warning System ['Mary'], with thanks to Morag Treanor, Heriot Watt University, CPAG and the study participants

Theory for the economic causes of the life expectancy trends



Modelled impact of changes to taxes and transfer payments (2010-2011 to 2021-22) on life expectancy, Scotland (preliminary analysis using Triple I tool)



Economic causes

- Different pathways for different groups
- Social security benefit cuts and increased conditions
- Cuts to public services and pressures on health & social care services
- Household incomes squeezed, precarious work



- Austerity measured as Cyclically Adjusted Primary Balance (CAPB) in terciles
- Europe (15 countries), 2011-2015
- Compared with countries in the lowausterity group, countries with intermediate austerity had excess mortality of 40 per 100,000 per year and those with high austerity had excess mortality of 31 per 100,000 per year.
- Generally good quality study
- No data beyond 2015 likely to underestimate effects



The and/our around Jamary 13, 2018

44 10.2105/AJF662019.30499

with the evidence being most comistent for

Published online ahead of print March 21, 2019 AJPH

mental health and saicides." A negative

Rajmi and Ferninger de Sammerner Peer Reviewed Research and Practice of

Rajmil, Luis; Fernández de Sanamed, María-José. Austerity Policies and Mortality Rates in European Countries, 2011–2015. AJPH 2019; 109: 768-870, doi:10.2105/AJPH.2019.304997.

- Austerity measured using the Alesina-Ardagna Fiscal Index (AAFI) (also called 'Blanchard Fiscal Index')
- Europe (28 countries), 1991-2013 (many up to 2012)
- Austerity regimes are associated with an increase in mortality of 0.7% after adjusting for recession effects
- Good quality study
- No data beyond 2012/3 likely to underestimate effects

A growing body of remarch has examined the effects of the Groat Recession on health, taing either single country time series analysis (De Vog'i, Marmot et al., 2012; Antonakakis and Colins, 2014; legidor, Barrio et al., 2014; Croat and Friedons, 2017; Kuplan, Collins et al., 2017; Toffolarti, McKee et al., 2018) or conse-country panel regensions (Stuckler et al., 2009; Chang et al., 2013; Taylor- Robinon and Bur, 2017; Pher-Moreno, Blanco-Aramaetal, 2015; Indedre (Dominik Strauss	A STREET
Veronica Toffolutti ^{4,0,6,4} , Marc Suhrcke ^{4,24} **Cate // Deatens ² Oney for issues is a side of ipported and hitk ibide, laced Universe, Mian, Inty **Depresent of Pails: leads and Mito, Landen Staal of ipported Implicit Metche, Leaden Universe, Mian, Inty **Demyering is its issues it. Internet of the Staal Topology is in the Staal of Implicit Metche, Leaden Universe, Mian, Inty **Depresent of Pails: leads and Mito, Landen Staal of ipported Implicit Metche, Leaden, United Kingden **Dearming is Matche Staal of Staal of Implicit Metche, Leaden Universe, Mian, Inty **Dearming is Matche Staal of Mito, Landen Staal of Implicit Metche, Leaden Universe, Mian, Inty **Dearming is Matche Staal of Mito, Internet is Mito, Internet is Mito, Internet is Matche Implicit Metche, Leaden Mito, Internet is Matche 2010 **Deared Internet Staal of Mito, 2019 **Deared Internet Matche 2019 **Deared Implicit Metche Implicit Metche, Leaden Mito, Internet Matche Implicit Metche, Leaden Mito, Internet Matche 2019 **Deared Internet Matche 2019 **Deared Implicit Metche Implicit Metche, Leaden Mito, Internet Matche Implicit Metche, Leaden Mito, Internet Matche Implicit Metche, Leaden Mito, Internet Matche, Internet Matche	
Agrice hatory Readword in avoide them 7.Telenary 2019 Accepted 2 March 2019 Accepted 2 March 2019 Accepted 2 March 2019 Represent: Reservoirs and heath Serveronic and heath Serveronic and heath Annerby Extended Constructions Agrice hatory of the Serveronic Weather and Serveronic Weat	
Ranket in Nickel fem 7 Telenary 2019 Renewed in Nickel fem 7 Telenary	
A growing body of nemerich has examined the effects of the Groat Recession on health, using either single country time series analysis (De Vogi, Marmot et al., 2012; Antonakakis and Colins, 2004; Regidor, Barrio et al., 2014; Crost and Friedon, 2017; Kaplan, Collins et al., 2017; Toffolarti, McKee et al., 2018) or conse-country panel regensional Start, 2007; Pher-Moreno, Blanco-Arametal, 2005; Robinson and Bart, 2007; Pher-Moreno, Blanco-Arametal, 2005;	spatisfic the association of mortality we mean mean may using data for 21 Bit respects the multi-present a surrocal, complex pict is mortality downsing (non-axing) effect which show the apposts effect. As some the verbase of CSI and these data to white the verbase (CSI and these data to white minim include): when a obtaining the Nation inficatily interacts which e-shall mortal initial (CSI). Overall, however it appears to the (mostly) montality down same genetics.
that most lity is its, with the exception of suicides, tend to be pos- optical, it, when unemployment rates increase most ally tend to that ago decline (Fuhm, 2000; Gerdtham and Ruhm, 2006). More excently, the association between the two seems to have weakened, and for- some ago-groupper and causers of most ally the association in the theramewhich se have severed (Lam and Pérind, 2007). As far as Europe is in recessions (the "headi- ship by using data for 27 European countries, finding robust	y (Tapia Granados and Ionides, 201 about the potential modification of fi book, Stuckler and Baru (2013) ha to advente health effects that appear cession would be directly attributable di concern echeed outside academ 6 former International Monetary Fu Kharij to ack "What about the hum agedy" (Guandian, 2010). The eviden parts to be conflicting with some pap agedy" (Guandian, 2010). The eviden parts to be conflicting with some pap agedy" (Guandian, 2010). The eviden parts to be conflicting with some pap agedy" (Guandian, 2010). The eviden parts of conflicting with some pap agedy" (Guandian, 2010). The sense of the some paper paper of the source of the paper of the source of th
Consequenting author as: "Carlo E Dendens" Genere for Baranch in Social Imparate stand Public Pelden, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016 Milan, Indy Pati - 20 di Staccioni, Incorrollandverday, via Rengen, 1,2016	ss the health-response to austerity ha noorporating fiscal policy measures, wi ital et al. (2017). The authors analyze t

Toffoluttia V, Suhrcke M. Does austerity really kill? Economics and Human Biology 2019; 33: 211-3.
- Austerity measured by welfare spending, adjusted for unemployment and GDP
- 2002-2014, Europe (25)
- GDP drops and increasing unemployment were associated with decreasing health inequalities. Austerity, however, was related to increasing health inequalities, an association that grew stronger with time.
- Good quality study though response rate for European Social Survey is highly variable across countries, and only self-rated health measures.
- No data beyond 2014 likely to underestimate effects

SOCIOLOGY OF HEALTH & ILLNESS

Saciology of Health & Illnew Vol. 40 Na. 4 2018 ISSN 0141-9889, pp. 750–768 doi: 10.1111/1467-9566.12723

European health inequality through the 'Great Recession': social policy matters

Kjetil A. van der Wel¹, Therese Saltkjel¹, Wen-Hao Chen², Espen Dahl¹ and Knut Halvorsen¹

¹Department of Social Work, Child Welfare and Social Policy, OsloMet – Oslo Metropolitan University, Oslo, Norway
²Social Analysis and Modelling Division, Statistics Canada, Ottawa, Canada

Abstract This paper investigates the association between the Great Recession and educational inequalities in self-rated general health in 25 European countries. We investigate four different indicators related to economic recession: GDP; unemployment; austerity and a 'crisis' indicator signifying severe simultaneous drops in GDP and welfare generosity. We also assess the extent to which health inequality changes can be attributed to changes in the economic conditions and social capital in the European populations. The paper uses data from the European Social Survey (2002-2014). The analyses include both cross-sectional and lagged associations using multilevel linear regression models with country fixed effects. This approach allows us to identify health inequality changes net of all timeinvariant differences between countries. GDP drops and increasing unemployment were associated with decreasing health inequalities. Austerity, however, was related to increasing health inequalities, an association that grew stronger with time. The strongest increase in health inequality was found for the more robust 'crisis' indicator. Changes in trust, social relationships and in the experience of economic hardship of the populations accounted for much of the increase in health inequality. The paper concludes that social policy has an important role in the development of health inequalities, particularly during times of economic crisis

Keywords: social determinants of health, social change, social capital, inequalities/social inequalities in health status, welfare state

Introduction

The 2008 financial crisis and the ensuing 'Great Recession' experienced by many European countries led to longstanding high levels of unemployment. According to scholars, the crisis was further deepened by inadequate policy responses as many countries – not only those answering to the 'Troika' – introduced austerity policies to balance national budgets (e.g. Karanikolos et al. 2013). The economic recession, and particularly when coupled with undeveloped or retrenching social protection, may in particular have had consequences for European health inequalities (Marmot et al. 2013; Stuckler and Basu 2013). Social inequality in health is a key public health challenge in Europe (European Commission 2013) and the European

© 2018 The Authors. Societogy of Modifi & Marcu published by John Wiley & Sons Luton Index 16 for SHE. This is an open access active under the terms of the Creative Common Authoritie License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction is any medium, provided the original work is properly dual.

van der Wel, Kjetil A.; Saltkjel, Therese; Chen, Wen-Hao; Dahl, Espen; Halvorsen, Knut. European health inequality through the 'Great Recession': social policy matters. Sociology of Health & Illness 2018; 40(4): 750-768, doi:10.1111/1467-9566.12723

- Austerity measured as change in Pension Credit and social care spending; local authorities in England, 2007-2013
- Each 1% decline in Pension Credit was associated with a 0.68% increase in mortality. Each 1% decline in social care spending was associated with a rise of 0.08% but not after adjusting for pension credit spending changes.
- Moderate quality study which could be confounded by deprivation, only to 2013, only oldest age group.



Austerity and old-age mortality in England: a longitudinal cross-local area analysis, 2007–2013

Rachel Loopstra¹, Martin McKee², Srinivasa Vittal Katikireddi³, David Taylor-Robinson⁴, Ben Barr⁴ and David Stuckler^{1,2}

Department of Sociology, Oxford University, Manor Rand Building, Manor Rand, Oxford OKI 3UQ, UK "Boolly of Rublic Health & Polay, London School of Hygiens & Topical Medicine, London WCI EPHT, UK "MRC/CSD Social & Public Health Sciences Unit, University of Glaspow, Glaspow Glasgow Glasgow, Glasgow Glasgow, Glasgow,

Summary

Objective: There has been significant concern that sustainity measures have negatively impacted health in the UK. We examined whether budgetary reductions in Pension Creaks and social care have been susociated with recent rises in mortality notes amongpensioners aged 85 years and owe. Design: Creas-local authority lengtudinal study Setting: Three hundred and twenty-four lower tier local

authorities in England. Main outcome measure: Annual percentage changes in ortality rates among pensioners aged 85 years or over Results: Between 2007 and 2013, each 1% decline in Pension indit spending (apport for low income pensioners) per refidary was associated with an increase in 0.68% in oldge mortality (95% CI: 0.41 to 0.95). Each reduction in the ber of beneficiaries per 1000 persionen was associated th an increase in 0.20% (95% CI: 0.15 to 0.24). Each 1% cline in social care spending was associated with a signifiant rise in old-age mortality (0.08%, 95% Cl: 0.0006-0.12) but not after adjusting for Persion Gredit spending. Similar atterns ware seen in both men and women. Wesley anocistions observed for those aged 75 to 84 years, and none among those 65 to 74 years. Categories of service expendurs not expected to affect old-age mortality, such as transrtation, showed no association.

portation, showed no saocatoon. Conclusions: Naing mortality ratio among pensioners aged 85 years and over were linked to netuctions in spending on income support for poor pensioners and social care. Findings suggest autority measures in England have affected volmershie old-que adults.

Keywords Old-age mortality, austerity, social security

Intro duction

The long-term decline in mortality among those aged 85 years and over in England has reversed, since 2010 among men and 2011 among women (Figure 1).¹ By

C The Royal Society of Melicine 2016 Reprints and permissions as genuin could/cosmals/Permissions.com

Loopstra R, McKee M, Katikireddi SV, Taylor-Robinson D, Barr B, Stuckler D. Austerity and old-age mortality in England: a longitudinal cross-local area analysis, 2007–2013. Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine 2016; 109(3):109-116, doi:10.1177/0141076816632215.

2013, rates for men were 4% higher than in 2010, while among women they were 6.1% higher. This was not seen in other older age groups, though the long-term decline among those aged 75 to 84 years, neer dty plateaued. Among those aged 65 to 74 years, and those just under pension age, mortality rates continued to decline. These unexplained increases have occurred in the context of a large-scale experiment with auterity measures in the UK. With a stated aim to reduce

measures in the UK. With a stated aim to reduce the deficit, the Coalition government sought cuts totalling EDS billion.² It reduced per capita spending on local services by 23.4% and made structural reforms to welfare administration and the generooity and conditions attached to receipt of benefits. In total, these changes resulted in a net zeduction in welfare expenditure of E167 billion, about 7% less than would be expected prior to these reforms.³ The coincidence of rising mortality and budget cuts has led several commentators to speculate that there might be a causal relationship.

Healthcare professionals are in the front line when it comes to dealing with the health consequences of some of these policies. A survey published in the BMJ in 2013 found that, among over 1000 GPs surveyed, 68% indicated that they had seen evidence of their patients' health being affected by reductions to their henefits, and 94% said their workload had increased to some degree due to increasing financial hardship among their patients.4 Rising claims for homelessness assistance have been linked to reduced spending on housing services and welfare support.5 Food bank use has been highest in areas facing largest cuts to be nefit spending and where most claimants have had their benefit payments stopped for failing to meet certain conditions⁶ Fit-for-work tests have coincided with rising suicides, prescriptions for anti-depressants and declining mental health.7 In turn, there have been calls for medical professionals to be involved

- Observational evidence that many health trends have worsened for those groups most exposed to benefit cuts and increased conditionality in the social security system.
- High quality evidence that some specific changes (e.g. increased conditionality for lone mothers receiving income support) have been detrimental for mental health.
- It is proving impossible to do better studies on this because the DWP will not co-operate to release relevant linked data.



Taulbut M, Agbato D, McCartney G. Working and hurting? Monitoring the health and health inequalities impacts of the economic downturn and chanes to the social security system. Glasgow, NHS Health Scotland, 2018.



What are the causes?

- Other factors could be playing a role
 - > Mental health problems and social isolation as mechanisms linking economic factors and mortality
 - > Obesity could be a mechanism linking economic factors to cardiovascular disease
 - > Large programme of work underway to investigate all causes at present

It's not an ageing population

• These trends are shown in life expectancy and age-standardised mortality data

It's not a 'natural' limit

- Trends have changed at all age groups, not just the oldest
- Trends are worst in the most deprived groups where life expectancy is already lowest
- Life expectancy continues to improve in countries who lead the world such as Japan

It's not 'flu

- All causes of death impacted including implausible causes such as drug-related deaths
- Trends changed in 2012 across most countries, not in the 'flu-year' 2015, and have been sustained subsequently
- All age groups impacted

Summary and implications

- This is the biggest public health challenge for many decades encompassing the sub-plots on drug deaths, homelessness, poverty, etc.
- Austerity, social security cuts, service cuts/pressures all likely to be causal
- We need to reverse and mitigate these economic and social policies
- We need to design our services to meet the unmet needs of the population and ensure accessibility to those who need those services most
- We need a public health approach to substance misuse
- We need your leadership to ensure all relevant policymakers and service managers at all levels understand the contribution they can make
- We have a duty to explain and champion action for our population/patients

All the data and evidence is summarised at: <u>www.scotpho.org.uk/population-dynamics/recent-mortality-trends/</u>

The programme of research and dissemination is detailed here: <u>https://www.scotphn.net/groups/public-health-mortality-</u> <u>monitoring/mortality-sig-introduction/</u>

Contact me at:

- Email: <u>gmccartney@nhs.net</u>
- Twitter: @gerrymccartney1

But what can I do (if I work in public health)?

- Ensure everyone is in receipt of the benefits they are entitled to through high quality service outreach.
- Ensure mitigation of inequalities through employment and procurement processes (see 'Maximising the role of NHSScotland in reducing health inequalities').
- Design our services to meet the unmet needs of the population and ensure accessibility to those who need those services most.
- Lead and influence across the 'whole system' for change.
- Ensure all your teams, managers, elected representatives, friends, etc., know what is going on and what is needed.

CiaranHumphnie Jane Parkinson low IllanBaker, Brow hnix eantu **AnnConacher AndyPulford** linRomsau DanyDon ahn trank AndreneGill CathDenholm GreaonSmit *is*Robertson Diar ĪrleneReynolds DavidWalsh AdeleGraham

- Leadership
- Research Administration
- Policy advice and navigation
- Resourcing
- Communications
- Engagement
- Data preparation
- Networking
- Challenge and support
- Policy influence

All the data and evidence is summarised on 'Recent Mortality Trends' page of ScotPHO.

The programme of research and dissemination is on the Mortality Special Interest Group page of ScotPHN website.

Contact: <u>gmccartney@nhs.net</u> @gerrymccartney1 All the data and evidence is summarised at: <u>www.scotpho.org.uk/population-dynamics/recent-mortality-trends/</u>

The programme of research and dissemination is detailed here: <u>https://www.scotphn.net/groups/public-health-mortality-</u> <u>monitoring/mortality-sig-introduction/</u>

Contact me at:

- Email: <u>gmccartney@nhs.net</u>
- Twitter: @gerrymccartney1